| <b>//</b>  | This was well-written and delight to read - thanks!                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            | Nicely done!                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| <b>✓</b>   | This is not correct.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| X*         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| Ø          | Don't do this. Common issues: "In my opinion," "On page X,," incorrect bold, underlined, or italicized font, using numerals rather than spelling out the word ("3" instead of "three" for numbers with less than three digits), etc.                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| o-o*       | It's not clear how these thoughts are related, so this is hard to follow. You should carefully explain, step by step, the connection between each point you're trying to make here.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| →←*        | This appears to contradict a claim you made earlier. Are you now rejecting the earlier claim? Or do you take the two to be compatible? Either way, you need to say more.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 1          | Upshot. You've starting making a point, but you haven't finished. What's the upshot? Once you figure it out, signpost the upshot: "This means that"                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <b>5</b> * | I'm not sure what you mean by this. Can you explain more, or try putting it differently?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| A*         | Awkward. This needs to be rewritten.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| BQ         | Block Quote. Quotations of four lines or more should start on their own line, be indented from the main text, and single-spaced. They do not need to be enclosed in quotation marks.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| С          | Consistency. Be consistent in your terminology, and don't introduce unnecessary synonyms just for its own sake – we value clarity and consistency over variety! Use just one word if you are referring to one thing, and use different words if you are referring to different things.                                                                                                                                                                     |
| CE         | <u>C</u> ategory <u>E</u> rror. Something has gotten mixed up here – e.g. confusing a concept/idea with the person who uses it (ideas cannot argue or show things, only people can!). There may be a dangling modifier (see <a href="https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/597/01/">https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/597/01/</a> ).                                                                                                       |
| C1*        | I think I understand the point you're trying to make here, but it needs to be expressed much more clearly and precisely.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| <b>D</b> * | Develop. Ooo! This might have potential! Alas, not enough is said about it. Consider making this your main point: explain in more detail, offer more support, etc.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Df*        | Definition. Given the nature of this assignment, you should define or characterize this in greater detail. All technical terms and key concepts should be defined the first time they appear. Don't appeal to a dictionary. Instead, characterize it based on how the word is used in our class, or the way that best fits your purposes.                                                                                                                  |
| <b>E</b> * | Evidence. Does this piece of evidence really demonstrate your claim? Is this the right kind of evidence? Either it isn't, or you should explain more clearly how this piece of evidence works.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| F          | Fluff. This doesn't seem to be contributing anything substantive to your argument.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| Fr         | Sentence fragment. This is not a complete sentence.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| FT         | Follow Through. Such as? Like what?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| I*         | In other words: you've claimed this, but where is it?  Identify. If you make mention of a premise, an argument, etc. you must clearly identify what it is. In other words, what is the exact claim the premises consist in? What are the premises and conclusion of the argument is? If you mention an analogy, you must identify what corresponds to what, what is the relevant shared property, and what property is being inferred through the analogy. |
| IC         | Improper Citation. For more, see e.g.<br>https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/560/02/                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

| Im  | Imprecise. Something is misstated here, or could be interpreted more than one way.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|     | Or: what is the difference between these two terms, if any? If they mean two different things, then explain the difference. If you really just mean the same thing, then you only need one.                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Ir  | Irrelevant. How is this related to the thesis? It is either irrelevant or the connection needs to be made much clearer.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| MT* | Missing Thesis. What is your <i>thesis idea</i> – the main claim(s) that you are trying to demonstrate in this paper? Imagine that I asked you to explain the whole point of your paper in one sentence – how would you express it in the clearest and most concise way possible?                                                                                                           |
|     | You may have set up the problem or question properly, but not presented the final <i>solution</i> or <i>result</i> . (E.g. After setting up "I will explore X" – which is not yet a thesis – you should explain whatever it is that you have <i>discovered</i> after your exploration of X.)                                                                                                |
|     | You may have listed multiple claims, each of which could be a thesis, without identifying which of them constitute the <i>primary</i> idea that the others function to support. Or, you may have provided a roadmap of what you are going to do in each section of the paper, without identifying the unifying idea that it is all in service of.                                           |
|     | A proper thesis should give some idea of what the main gist of your argument will be, e.g. "I will argue that X because Y"                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|     | Normally, the thesis idea is placed at the end of the introductory paragraph.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|     | For more, see "Constructing a Thesis Statement" at <a href="http://www.public.asu.edu/~dportmor/tips.pdf">http://www.public.asu.edu/~dportmor/tips.pdf</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| NM* | Needs More. More needs to be said here – <i>this</i> is precisely what you should be explaining/arguing for! Can you put it in your own words? What exactly is going on here, and how exactly does this claim, example, etc. relate back to your thesis? See also S.                                                                                                                        |
|     | In explaining a point from the text, you should try to do so as clearly as possible and <i>in your own words</i> . Imagine that you are explaining this to a friend who has never read the text before – how could you put it as clearly and simply as possible, in ordinary language? Can you illustrate with an example? Can you go through it step by step? Don't just restate the text! |
|     | For more, see "Paraphrases" at <a href="http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/writing.html">http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/writing.html</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| P   | Parallelism. Make sure equivalent clauses or other parts of a sentence are marked with grammatically parallel language.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|     | E.g. I will argue that X, that Y, and finally that Z.<br>E.g. A defends this claim in order to X and to Y.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| PA* | PLAGIARISM ALERT. This is bordering on plagiarism – DO NOT DO THIS AGAIN.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |

|            | It is not enough to merely provide a citation for some idea; one must paraphrase it. It is                                                                                                                           |
|------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            | not enough for paraphrasing to merely substitute some synonyms; one must put the idea                                                                                                                                |
|            | in one's own words.                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|            | For more, see "Paraphrases" at                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|            | http://www.jimpryor.net/teaching/guidelines/writing.html                                                                                                                                                             |
| Q*         | Quotations. Quotations should be correctly punctuated, correctly formatted, and well-                                                                                                                                |
| ~          | integrated into the text.                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|            | For more, see <a href="https://writingcenter.unc.edu/tips-and-tools/quotations/">https://writingcenter.unc.edu/tips-and-tools/quotations/</a> and                                                                    |
| -          | https://unilearning.uow.edu.au/academic/4bi.html                                                                                                                                                                     |
| R          | Redundant. This sentence does not contain any new information and does not seem to                                                                                                                                   |
| Ro         | contributing anything further.                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| <b>S</b> * | Run-on sentence. This should be broken into two (or more) simpler claims.  Support. This claim is not well-supported. What are your reasons for thinking this?                                                       |
| <b>S</b>   | What is the line of thinking that led you to make this claim?                                                                                                                                                        |
|            | What is the line of thinking that let you to make this claim.                                                                                                                                                        |
|            | What evidence can you provide for it? (Textual evidence? Argumentative evidence?                                                                                                                                     |
|            | Empirical evidence?)                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Sp         | Specify. What is, exactly? What is "this X" or "it"?                                                                                                                                                                 |
| St         | Style. The style of writing here is either too informal for an academic paper or else is                                                                                                                             |
|            | overly wrought, unnecessarily verbose, awkward, or unclear (due, perhaps, to a                                                                                                                                       |
|            | misconstrual of academic style). For tips, see                                                                                                                                                                       |
|            | https://library.leeds.ac.uk/info/485/academic_skills/331/academic_writing/5 or this                                                                                                                                  |
| T          | (rather irreverent) guide at: <a href="https://smartblogger.com/editing-tips/">https://smartblogger.com/editing-tips/</a> Tense. Use appropriate tense: present tense for claims about the content of the text, past |
| 1          | tense for historical claims about the content of the text or author                                                                                                                                                  |
|            | tense for instorted claims about the content of the text of author                                                                                                                                                   |
|            | E.g. A argues that X, because A was responding to the view that Z.                                                                                                                                                   |
| TE*        | <u>Textual Evidence</u> . Where is the textual evidence for this claim?                                                                                                                                              |
| Th*        | Thesis. Tie this back to your thesis!                                                                                                                                                                                |
|            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|            | For more, see "Making the Structure of Your Paper Perspicuous" in                                                                                                                                                    |
| Ti         | http://www.public.asu.edu/~dportmor/tips.pdf                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 11         | Title. This title is not correctly punctuated. See: <a href="https://web.cn.edu/kwheeler/documents/Punctuating_Titles_chart.pdf">https://web.cn.edu/kwheeler/documents/Punctuating_Titles_chart.pdf</a>              |
| T/F        | <u>True/False</u> – Truth and falsity are properties of <i>statements</i> , not arguments!                                                                                                                           |
| Tr*        | Transition. This needs a transition, or it needs a better transition. Transitions should                                                                                                                             |
|            | indicate <i>logical</i> or <i>evidential</i> relationships between claims or paragraphs.                                                                                                                             |
|            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|            | For more, see <a href="http://writingcenter.unc.edu/handouts/transitions/">http://writingcenter.unc.edu/handouts/transitions/</a> and "Making the                                                                    |
|            | Structure of Your Paper Perspicuous" in                                                                                                                                                                              |
|            | http://www.public.asu.edu/~dportmor/tips.pdf                                                                                                                                                                         |
| TT         | Technical Term. This is being used incorrectly here.                                                                                                                                                                 |
| U/M        | Use/Mention. When you use a term or concept, do not place it in quotation marks.                                                                                                                                     |
|            | When you <i>mention</i> a term or concept, place it in quotation marks.                                                                                                                                              |
|            | E.g.                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|            | Use People disagree about what morality requires: should we                                                                                                                                                          |
|            | be consequentialists or deontologists?                                                                                                                                                                               |
|            | Mention I will use "morality" to refer to a system of social norms and                                                                                                                                               |

|           | practices that facilitate in-group cooperation.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| UQ        | Unnecessary Quotation. Do not use quotations <i>in place of</i> explaining the text in your own words. (Think of quotations as chunks of "stuff" that you're dropping into the text and pointing at for the reader to see. Putting in too many "unprocessed" quotations leaves to the reader too much of the work that <i>you're</i> supposed to be doing for them.) Quotations should be used sparingly and effectively: only use a direct quote if it is an important piece of textual evidence or if it is an idea that it is impossible to express more clearly and concisely in your own words. They should provide direct and obvious support for the claim being made; if the connection is not obvious, it should be given further explanation.  For more, see <a href="http://www.lib.usf.edu/writing/files/2012/10/summarizing_paraphrasing_quoting.pdf">http://www.lib.usf.edu/writing/files/2012/10/summarizing_paraphrasing_quoting.pdf</a> |
| V         | Voicing. Make clear whether the claims being made belong to you or the author, and make clear what stance you are taking on them.  For more on voice, see <a href="http://www.uefap.com/writing/function/voice.htm">http://www.uefap.com/writing/function/voice.htm</a> and the "Thesis Whisperer Verb Cheat Sheet" at <a href="https://thesiswhisperer.com/2013/07/03/how-to-create-authoritative-voice-in-your-writing/">https://thesiswhisperer.com/2013/07/03/how-to-create-authoritative-voice-in-your-writing/</a>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| V/IV/S/US | <u>V</u> alid/ <u>I</u> nvalid/ <u>S</u> ound/ <u>U</u> nsound – These terms apply only to <i>arguments</i> , not statements/claims!                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| WC        | <u>W</u> ord <u>C</u> hoice. I understand what you mean, but this isn't the best word or phrase for what you're trying to say.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| WW        | Wrong Word. This word isn't being used correctly, and/or I'm not sure why you chose it.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |

## **Further Notes:**

The comments on your paper are (roughly) color-coded according to following evaluation criteria:

Yellow is for the basics: grammar, style, and mechanics.

Orange is for evaluating the structure and organization of the paper (throughout the paper and within paragraphs), as well as the precision and clarity of the writing.

Green is for evaluating the use of evidence (textual and argumentative).

## Blue is for critical evaluation of content.

Items bolded with an asterisk are particularly important. The grading scale includes slash grades: a borderline paper between a B and B+, for example, would get a B/B+. These slash grades will not appear in your final grades for the course, but they are used for assignments throughout the term.

Here are some guidelines for interpreting your grades: Grades in the B range represent solid, acceptable work; a B+ paper includes some things are done quite well, and a B- paper includes some significant problems. An A-paper is one that begins to stand out from the rest, and an A paper is one which does everything exceptionally well and admits of only minor improvements. Grades in the C range indicate that the papers exhibit major problems with regard to writing or to the assignment.